1. **August 19, 2016 – CAL CEO Fabian Whorms Paul and CAL CFO Tibbetts receive similar emails to below. CAL Chairman Philp Rankin is not in receipt of any emails. Fabian Whorms however advises Mr. Rankin that the PAC hearing for CAL (which he has customarily attended in the past) is set for Wednesday August 31 at 10:00am. The time and date for the PAC hearing however, conflicts with a previously arranged important meeting between Cayman Airways, the Cayman Islands Airport Authority, the Hon. Deputy Premier, the Hon. Minister of Finance and the Financial Secretary.**

**From:** Merren-Chin, Zena [mailto:Zena.Merren-Chin@gov.ky]
**Sent:** Friday, August 19, 2016 4:53 PM
**To:** Fabian Whorms <fabianwhorms@caymanairways.net>
**Cc:** Harvey, Ceretta <Ceretta.Harvey@gov.ky>; McLaughlin, LeSanneo <LeSanneo.McLaughlin@gov.ky>
**Subject:** Invitation - PAC Hearing

Dear Mr Whorms

Please find attached a letter of invitation from the Public Accounts Committee to attend a hearing on Wednesday 31st August 2016 at 10:00am.  Also attached is a copy of the CAL Financial Statements for the end ended 30 June 2014.

Please confirm your attendance at the meeting.

Regards

Zena Merren-Chin

Clerk of the Legislative Assembly

Cayman Islands

Legislative Assembly Building

POBox 190

33 Fort Street

George Town

Grand Cayman

KY1-1103

1 345 949 4236 (phone)

1 345 244 5608 (direct)

1 345 949 9514 (fax)

1. **August 23, 2016. Fabian Whorms after telephone discussion with Mrs. Merren-Chin, respectfully sends the following email requesting if an alternative date and time is available. At this time Chairman Rankin is not in receipt of any invitation and CAL assumes he is not receiving one.**

**From:** Fabian Whorms [mailto:fabianwhorms@caymanairways.net]
**Sent:** Tuesday, August 23, 2016 5:07 PM
**To:** Merren-Chin, Zena
**Cc:** Harvey, Ceretta; McLaughlin, LeSanneo
**Subject:** RE: Invitation - PAC Hearing

Dear Clerk of the Legislative Assembly, Mrs. Merren-Chin,

As you are aware, both myself and CAL’s EVP/CFO Mr. Paul Tibbetts are currently invited to attend the PAC hearing on August 31 at 10:100 am.

The time and date for the PAC hearing, conflicts with a previously arranged and important meeting between Cayman Airways, the Cayman Islands Airport Authority, the Hon. Deputy Premier, the Hon. Minister of Finance and the Financial Secretary.

In recognising the difficulties that arise with rescheduling the previously mentioned meeting, given the various schedules of all involved in attending, I am requesting if any alternatives are available to Cayman Airways with respect to the PAC hearing.

Kind Regards

**Fabian Whorms**

President & CEO

Cayman Airways Ltd.

1. **August 23, 2016 Fabian Whorms receives the following email where the PAC offers a new date and time. There is still no mention of any invitation to Chairman Rankin.**

**From:** Merren-Chin, Zena [mailto:Zena.Merren-Chin@gov.ky]
**Sent:** Tuesday, August 23, 2016 5:13 PM
**To:** Fabian Whorms <fabianwhorms@caymanairways.net>
**Cc:** Harvey, Ceretta <Ceretta.Harvey@gov.ky>; McLaughlin, LeSanneo <LeSanneo.McLaughlin@gov.ky>
**Subject:** RE: Invitation - PAC Hearing

Mr Whorms

I note the contents of your e-mail below.  Please advise if you would be available on Thursday 1st September 2016 at 10:00am to attend before the PAC.

Kind Regards

Zena Merren-Chin

1. **August 23, 2016 Fabian Whorms responds as below:**

 **From:** Fabian Whorms
**Sent:** Tuesday, August 23, 2016 5:55 PM
**To:** Merren-Chin, Zena <Zena.Merren-Chin@gov.ky>
**Cc:** Harvey, Ceretta <Ceretta.Harvey@gov.ky>; McLaughlin, LeSanneo <LeSanneo.McLaughlin@gov.ky>
**Subject:** Re: Invitation - PAC Hearing

Dear Mrs. Merren-Chin

August 1, 2016 at 10 am is perfect.

Please confirm if possible.

Regards

Fabian

1. **August 26, 2016, Fabian Whorms sends email below requesting confirmation of the mew date and time:**

**From:** Fabian Whorms
**Sent:** Friday, August 26, 2016 10:24 AM
**To:** Merren-Chin, Zena <Zena.Merren-Chin@gov.ky>
**Cc:** Harvey, Ceretta <Ceretta.Harvey@gov.ky>; McLaughlin, LeSanneo <LeSanneo.McLaughlin@gov.ky>
**Subject:** RE: Invitation - PAC Hearing

Dear Mrs. Merren-Chin,

Can you confirm new time of 10:00 am on September 1, 2016.

My apology for typing august in my prior email.

Kind Regards

**Fabian Whorms**

President & CEO

Cayman Airways Ltd.

1. **August 26, 2016 – Fabian Whorms receives the below confirmation.**

**From:** Merren-Chin, Zena [mailto:Zena.Merren-Chin@gov.ky]
**Sent:** Friday, August 26, 2016 10:28 AM
**To:** Fabian Whorms <fabianwhorms@caymanairways.net>
**Subject:** RE: Invitation - PAC Hearing

Mr. Whorms

I realized you intended September. The meeting is confirmed for 10am on Thursday 1st September 2016.

Regards

Zena Merren-Chin

1. **August 30, 2016 - Fabian Whorms and Paul Tibbetts receive the following and accept the calendar invitation. There is still no mention of Chairman Rankin.**

**From:** Harvey, Ceretta [mailto:Ceretta.Harvey@gov.ky]
**Sent:** Tuesday, August 30, 2016 11:20 AM
**To:** Fabian Whorms <fabianwhorms@caymanairways.net>; Paul Tibbetts <paultibbetts@caymanairways.net>
**Subject:** RE: PAC Meeting - CAL
**Importance:** High

Good morning Mr Whorms and Mr Tibbetts,

We kindly ask that you confirm attendance by reply or Calendar invite to the PAC Meeting being held on Thursday, 1 September at 10:00am.

Kind regards,

**Ceretta Harvey** | **Parliamentary Officer**

Direct: 345 244 5606 | Main: 345 949 4236 | Fax: 345 949 9514

E-mail: Ceretta.Harvey@gov.ky | [www.cila.ky](http://www.cila.ky/)

1. **August 30, 2016 - Fabian Whorms sends below to further confirm attendance and advises that Chairman Rankin will also attend this session, as he is a signatory to CAL’s financials. Fabian Whorms copies Chairman Rankin in this email which was sent knowing from discussions with Mr. Rankin that he wishes to attend the PAC hearing for CAL, despite not receiving any invitations to date.**

**From:** Fabian Whorms
**Sent:** Tuesday, August 30, 2016 11:55 AM
**To:** 'Harvey, Ceretta' <Ceretta.Harvey@gov.ky>; Paul Tibbetts <paultibbetts@caymanairways.net>
**Cc:** Philip Rankin (rankinco@candw.ky) <rankinco@candw.ky>
**Subject:** RE: PAC Meeting - CAL

Dear Ceretta,

This is to confirm that Cayman Airways will be attending the PAC hearing. Please be advised that the Chairman of our Board of Directors, Mr. Philip Rankin CPA, being a signatory on our financial statements, will be accompanying myself and Mr. Tibbetts.

Kind Regards

**Fabian Whorms**

President & CEO

Cayman Airways Ltd.

1. **August 30, 2016, Fabian Whorms is advised as below that Chairman Rankin is to attend a separate session from the 10:00 am session with CAL’s CEO and CFO. This session is one which Mr. Rankin knows nothing about, having never received any invitations to date. It is further stated as an afternoon session. There is immediate concern by CAL and Chairman Rankin who now receives this email, as the reply now includes his email address, since he was copied in the earlier email from Fabian Whorms. This afternoon session is also in conflict with a pre-established meeting with the Hon. DP, Chief Officer in the Ministry of Tourism and the Department of Tourism. DP at 1:30 pm.**

**From:** Harvey, Ceretta [mailto:Ceretta.Harvey@gov.ky]
**Sent:** Tuesday, August 30, 2016 12:44 PM
**To:** Fabian Whorms <fabianwhorms@caymanairways.net>; Paul Tibbetts <paultibbetts@caymanairways.net>
**Cc:** Phillip BOD <rankinco@candw.ky>; Merren-Chin, Zena <Zena.Merren-Chin@gov.ky>
**Subject:** RE: PAC Meeting - CAL

Mr Whorms

Thank you for this, however the Committee has advised that your colleague, Mr Rankin attends only for the afternoon session which commences 1:30pm.

Should you have any further queries please do not hesitate to contact us.

Kind regards,

**Ceretta Harvey** | **Parliamentary Officer**

Direct: 345 244 5606 | Main: 345 949 4236 | Fax: 345 949 9514

E-mail: Ceretta.Harvey@gov.ky | [www.cila.ky](http://www.cila.ky/)

1. **August 30, 2016, Fabian Whorms calls Ceretta Harvey and advises that Chairman Rankin knows nothing about an afternoon session but had arranged his schedule to attend the morning session, even though he had not received any invitation. Fabian Whorms asked why Chairman Rankin was being asked to attend separately from the CEO and CFO and was advised that the PAC wanted to interview the Chairman separately from management. Ceretta Harvey then sends below ( although address to Mr. Whorms, it is assumed meant for Mr. Rankin):**

**From:** Harvey, Ceretta [mailto:Ceretta.Harvey@gov.ky]
**Sent:** Tuesday, August 30, 2016 1:39 PM
**To:** Phillip BOD <rankinco@candw.ky>
**Cc:** Fabian Whorms <fabianwhorms@caymanairways.net>
**Subject:** FW: PAC Invite

Good afternoon Mr Whorms

**Unfortunately I was unaware of your active email address**. Attached please find the **PAC Invite for Thursday, 1 September at 1:30pm**. I will follow this email with a calendar invite and ask that you advise as soon as possible.

Kind regards,

**Ceretta Harvey** | **Parliamentary Officer**

Direct: 345 244 5606 | Main: 345 949 4236 | Fax: 345 949 9514

E-mail: Ceretta.Harvey@gov.ky | [www.cila.ky](http://www.cila.ky/)

**Summary in response to the CNS article / PAC Chairman’s comments and actions:**

1. The PAC chairman stated that despite efforts to change times and dates for some witnesses to accommodate their schedules, some were still failing to attend or sending last minute excuses.
	1. This is not the case with Mr. Rankin, he was never aware of the afternoon session, as the invitation was sent to an incorrect email address. When the email was eventually sent to the correct email address, this was two days before the PAC hearing. Mr Rankin was only aware of the morning session by notification from Fabian Whorms and he planned his affairs to attend the morning session.
2. The CNS article reads: Following the failure of Phillip Rankin, the chair of Cayman Airways, to attend Thursday’s meeting, even after the times had been rearranged to accommodate him, Miller issued a summons for his attendance next week.
	1. No PAC hearing times were rearranged at the request of Chairman Rankin, they were arranged for CEO Whorms and CFO Tibbets. Chairman Rankin had no knowledge of the afternoon session on either August 31 or September 1, until August 30, the initial invitations were sent to Chairman Rankin at an invalid and inactive email address, which was never assigned to or used by Chairman Rankin. It should be noted that no additional efforts were made to contact Mr. Rankin by the PAC, and were it not for CEO Whorms inquiring to the PAC about attending the morning session on September 1, with CEO Whorms and CFO Tibbets. Chairman Rankin did not know about the afternoon session at this time.
* If the original invitation had been sent to the correct email address, Chairman Rankin would not have needed any reschedule, as he had no conflicting business on the afternoon of August 31.
* While the reschedule that was done to accommodate Fabian Whorms and Paul Tibbets posed no problem for Chairman Rankin, the reschedule that was done for Chairman Rankin was not requested. It is therefore incorrect to say that anything was rearranged to accommodate him.
1. Mr. Miller stated that “civil servants” are not taking requests to attend seriously.
	* While Mr. Rankin is the Chairman of a public entity, he is not employed by the public entity nor by the CIG. He serves as Chairman on a voluntary basis without any remuneration.
	* Mr. Rankin, despite not being a civil servant, has attended every PAC meeting with CAL management since 2009. It is very unfair to state or imply that Chairman Rankin, takes anything to do with Cayman Airways less than seriously.
	* Mr. Rankin actually had every intention to attend the morning session which he was aware of, with the CEO and CFO of CAL, he was not aware of the evening session until two days before.
	* Whereas this unknown afternoon session posed a challenge for Mr. Rankin as he had another meeting previously schedule, Mr. Rankin was also intent to attend that afternoon session, under the circumstances, despite the short notice.
	* Mr. Miller however opened the morning session advising in his opening remarks that a summons was being issued for Mr. Rankin to attend a PAC hearing in the following week. CEO Fabian Whorms advised Chairman Rankin of this announcement by the PAC chair which cancelled the afternoon session and Whorms also advised that the new date and time would be prescribed by summons.
	* **Mr. Rankin up to this time, has not received any summons to attend any future meeting.**
	* **Mr. Rankin has however received an invitation this afternoon (at the correct email address) to attend on Thursday September 8, 2016. This is only three days’ notice but Chairman Rankin has advised that he will arrange his schedule (as always) to suit CAL’s affairs.**